

New Albany Historic Preservation Commission

Meeting Minutes

July 12, 2007

Chairman Ted Fulmore called the meeting to order at 7:01 PM and read a statement explaining the Commission's purpose and procedures. Other members present were Dave Barksdale, Maury Goldberg, Vicky Nugent, Mark Sanders, Brett Scharlow, Brandon Smith and as well as ex officio member Scott Wood and administrator Laura Renwick. Members Randy Lescault and Bill Transue were absent.

Approval of Agenda

☞ Goldberg moved to approve the agenda for the meeting. Seconded by Nugent, motion carried.

Approval of Minutes/Financial Report

☞ Smith noted that the recording of the June meeting was faulty, only capturing about the first five minutes. Renwick's written minutes covered the majority of the meeting other than the final few minutes. Goldberg moved to approve the minutes of the June meeting. Seconded by Scharlow, motion carried. Goldberg reported that the City is still operating under last year's budget, awaiting approval of the state for this year's.

Certificate of Appropriateness Reviews:

☞ Redding (1214 E. Elm St.) – William and Dolores Redding were present to discuss this application, for repairs to the front porch and replacement of the hand rail at the front steps, gutter and flashing repairs and repair or replacement of the dormer windows. Renwick noted that much of the work could have been approved by staff but that a couple items – such as the new handrail and the possible window replacement – went beyond her authority to approve. The Reddings also plan to install a simple handrail at the back steps to allow greater safety while the front steps are being worked on and unusable. The dormer window sash would be repaired if possible or replicated if needed, although they would be changed to swing inward. The porch rail area is currently covered with vinyl siding, with beadboard behind it. The Reddings are proposing to remove the vinyl siding and restore either the beadboard or the balustrade, if one is present. Barksdale and Mr. Redding noted that the correct construction date of this, the Edward C. Riley House, is 1898 rather than c.1910 as is stated in the Interim Report.

Barksdale moved to find as a fact that the proposed project is compatible with the character of the historic district, based on the following design standard – Po1-Po3, Po10, Po11, Po15; R9-R11, R18; W1-W6, and W8. These findings are made subject to the following conditions: the front porch handrail will be of wood, the back porch handrail will be of wood or metal; the outdoor carpet may be removed from the front porch and the floor sanded and painted; the porch railing may also be exposed and the beadboard or balustrade sanded and painted; repair of the dormer windows is strongly encouraged, but if replacement is necessary the existing windows will be duplicated in size, materials and design and as divided lights. Seconded by Goldberg and unanimously approved. Based on the preceding findings of fact, Barksdale moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions above. Seconded by Goldberg and unanimously approved.

☞ Culbertson West (904 E. Main St.) – Carl Holliday and Steve Goodman were present to discuss this application, for installing a new metal fence along the Main and 9th street sidewalks. Barksdale provided historic photos from 1893 and 1905 showing the design of the fence that had originally stood here – only the limestone base and three stone caps remain. Except for the design of the finials, the fence was very similar to the one that remains at the Culbertson Mansion. The fence that is proposed is not a replica of the historic fence but a very simple design, with the gates sharing the same design and height. The intent is to match the height of the adjacent fence as closely as possible while using one of the standard heights that is available. It would be mounted behind and above the limestone base to minimize the risk of damaging the base. The applicants stated that they would eventually like to have the missing limestone piers recast or find compatible replacements. Scharlow stressed the importance to the streetscape of consistency with the height and location of the Culbertson Mansion's fence.

Barksdale moved to find as a fact that the proposed project is compatible with the character of the historic district, based on the following design standards: Si5-Si8 and Si10. This finding is made subject to the following conditions: fence will be iron, with a black finish, and its height will match that of the Culbertson Mansion's fence as closely as possible; the fence will be mounted directly behind and above the level of the limestone base that is currently in place; the gates at the alley and sidewalks will match the height of the

fence; the fence will be constructed to meet all applicable Planning and Zoning standards; the existing historic limestone caps will not be impacted, but if appropriate piers can be located staff has the authority to approve their reinstallation. Seconded by Goldberg and approved 6-1. Based on the preceding findings of fact, Barksdale moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions above. Seconded by Goldberg and approved 6-1.

☞ Anshutz (1006 E. Spring St.) – Stephen Anshutz was present to discuss this application for demolition of the deteriorated front porch, and presented photos showing its condition. The house was constructed c.1857 but the porch first appears in the 1898 Sanborn maps, and the columns have been replaced since (round columns were found in the attic). The center windows on the second story extend to the floor, so there may have originally been a balcony there – a contractor saw what he believed may have been remnants of its structure, and other evidence could be uncovered if the existing porch is removed. The long-range plan for the house is to rebuild an appropriate balcony and to remove the aluminum siding. Barksdale moved to find as a fact that the proposed project is compatible with the character of the historic district, based on design standards Po1 – Po3 and because evidence was presented that the porch is not original. This finding is made subject to the following conditions: the area that is uncovered will be documented with photographs before being covered by aluminum siding to match the existing. Seconded by Goldberg and unanimously approved. Based on the preceding findings of fact, Barksdale moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions above. Seconded by Goldberg and unanimously approved. The HPC thanked Anshutz for his purchase of this property, which may be an Isaac Smith design.

☞ Fulmore (838 Cedar Bough Pl.) – Renwick provided copies of this COA application re-roofing and box gutter repairs, which Greg Sekula of Historic Landmarks had approved as staff during her absence.

Hearing of visitors

☞ Brenda Scharlow (Urban Enterprise Association) – Ms. Scharlow presented information about a new program the UEA is attempting to institute: "Eyes of the City." Many downtown merchants have boarded their upper story windows to reduce maintenance and prevent merchandise fading (particularly in the furniture stores). The program would encourage the uncovering of these windows through financial assistance for repairs or new windows. As currently envisioned, there would be three levels of projects – Level 1 would help with installation of new bronzed aluminum windows with tinted glass; Level 2 would be in cases where windows remained and were in decent condition, and would assist with repair expenses and the installation of new glass; Level 3 would be for the exact duplication of historic windows. Fulmore expressed the HPC's support for this idea but reminded Ms. Scharlow that – to ensure fairness and consistency – the HPC would need to review a COA for each building individually (although repair work may not require review). Wood suggested that he and Renwick work with the UEA to develop their application.

Old Business

☞ Enforcement Update – Renwick reported that she still had not received any information City Attorney Shane Gibson regarding the city's enforcement efforts despite numerous attempts to contact him. Goldberg expressed concern regarding the windows at the City-owned Schrader Stable (118 W. Main). Wood reported that the Street Department was planning to resecure the building the following day.

☞ CLG grant update – Renwick reported that she had received the additional information and photographs from the consultant, and will be double-checking it prior to submitting it to the state. They should be ready to go before the state Review Board at its October meeting.

☞ Silvercrest Hospital – Fulmore reported he had heard that one of the bidders – Matt Chalfant – has purchased the property for use as an assisted living facility. He is reportedly working with a preservation-sensitive architect.

☞ Awards committee – Nugent reported that Valerie at Bruce Fox is still looking for the original casting of the award, which would significantly reduce the cost of producing new plaques. Ordering a greater number of plaques would also reduce the cost – this would be a possibility because they would not include a date.

☞ Unsafe Building Committee – Fulmore reported that the City Council committee on unsafe buildings had not met since March. A neighborhood forum is being planned for August on how the two buildings at 1746 Ekin Avenue and 921 East 11th Street were saved from the city's 'hit list' and how that could be duplicated by other groups. Good progress is being made on the rehab of those two houses, with neighborhood kids even getting involved with painting on Ekin Avenue.

☞ Conservation District status – Renwick did not receive an official opinion from City Attorney Gibson about the status of the conservation district on Elm Street, but asked Smith to review the ordinance based on his legal training. He noted that section 151.04 B(2) of the ordinance states that the Commission *shall* have a

procedure for receiving objections for the change from conservation to historic district, but no procedure was included in the HPC's Rules of Procedure. Wood recommended that the Commission move forward with contacting the property owners and gathering their opinions. A resolution covering the procedure could be adopted by the HPC in the short term, with the Rules of Procedure amended eventually. Fulmore, Smith, Wood and Renwick will serve on a committee to work with the City Attorney on this issue, and Smith will draft a preliminary resolution for review.

☞ Increased fee for COAs submitted post-work – Renwick investigated whether other Indiana communities had a larger fee for COA applications submitted after the start of work. Indianapolis was the only community she found with that policy, which is included with as part of a very complex COA fee system based on the type and cost of work. She will investigate out-of-state experiences with an inquiry to the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions list-serve. Smith recommended that this issue should also be run past the City Attorney for his input.

☞ Change in meeting date – Fulmore has approached the head of the Police Merit Commission about giving the HPC priority for use of the large meeting room (unless the Merit Commission is expecting a large crowd) but has not yet received an answer. The September meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, September 12 to avoid Rosh Hashanah.

☞ 2007 grant planning – Several grant opportunities are upcoming and a consensus needs to be established on what projects and funding sources to pursue, and what matching funds will be used. Barksdale, Smith, Goldberg and Renwick volunteered to serve on the committee [Lescault was added after the meeting]. Fulmore recommended that Mike Ladd of the Urban Enterprise Association should also be kept informed.

New Business

☞ Historic bridge inventory – The Indiana Department of Transportation is working with consulting group Mead and Hunt to inventory all the historic bridges in the state. This inventory will be used to create lists of 'select' and 'non-select' bridges. Select bridges will be those which should be preserved, while those deemed non-select will have a streamlined review process for work or replacement. Historic Landmarks is coordinating volunteers in each county to double-check the inventories that Mead and Hunt has developed, and will be hosting a training session with bridge expert Jim Cooper on August 9 in Jeffersonville. Wood volunteered to review the Floyd County information.

Miscellaneous / Announcements

☞ Barksdale announced that there will a dedication of a Monon Railroad historic marker on Saturday July 14 at 11 AM, at the corner of Bank Street and Culbertson Avenue.

☞ There will also be a historic marker dedicated for Cardinal Joseph Ritter, on Sunday, July 22 at 4 PM at 1218 East Oak Street. This will be Floyd County's 18th marker, which is the third most in the state.

☞ Renwick announced that Historic Landmarks' Regional Annual Meeting will be held on the evening of July 20 in Corydon and distributed invitations to HPC members.

Meeting adjourned at approximately 9:07 PM

Respectfully submitted,

Laura Renwick